DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION OF SCORING RUBRICS FOR THE INDUSTRIAL TECHNOLOGY PROGRAMS

Farzin Heidari

Industrial Technology Department Texas A&M University-Kingsville

Abstract

The process of assessment is to measure student performance. Industrial technology professors need to make sure that the assignments are scored as objectively as possible when evaluating a project. A rubric helps to set clear expectations and defines the quality of work for a given project. Descriptive scoring schemes have become a common method for evaluating course content [1,2]. The descriptive scale supports the evaluation of the criteria set for each project. The focus of this paper is the design and implementation of scoring rubric models for industrial technology programs. The major points of this paper include identifying common definitions of assessment, identifying specific observable attributes in evaluating student performance, defining and brainstorming characteristics that describe each attribute, and the designing and implementation of scoring rubrics for industrial technology courses. The following steps are involved in developing scoring rubrics: defining and listing learning objectives for industrial technology courses, identifying the specific attributes that students should demonstrate in their performance, identifying each attribute and its characteristics, and identifying the excellent and poor quality work using narrative descriptive criteria. Holistic rubrics and analytical rubrics are the most common types of rubrics used to measure students' understanding of course content. Holistic rubrics provide a choice to state the highest and lowest levels of performance combining the descriptors for all attributes and analytical rubrics state the highest and lowest levels of performance using the descriptions for each attribute separately [3,4]. The use of rubrics allows the instructor to provide quality feed back to the student along with providing evaluation and reflection opportunities for an instructor as well. The use of rubrics in industrial technology program will provide accountability and evaluation that is beneficial to both students and the department.

1. Introduction

Designing a valuable assessment to measure students' understanding of course content is both challenging and complicated, especially if designed prior to establishing clear course objectives, goals, and expectations. The purpose of assessments is to reinforce the accountability of both the student and instructor. This gives the student an opportunity to demonstrate their full potential, capacity, and ability to internalize, process, and apply the presented course content. Furthermore, the instructor has provided an opportunity to process results and determine student strengths and weaknesses within the course. This is a beneficial instrument to generate purposeful feedback for students to recognize their misconceptions and reconceptualize these deficiencies within the course content. At the same time, instructors reevaluate their educational

techniques and improve their effectiveness, to better steer students away from common misconceptions. The industrial technology professors can take this evaluation piece a step further by incorporating the rubric.

The purpose of the rubric is to outline the assessment's expectations with required course related details. Typically, a rubric assigns a score range based on student performance of outlined expectations. Curriculum experts believe that educators who design rubrics will be more effective educators [4]. Professors will be compelled during the evaluation process to think meticulously about generating successful student outcomes. The industrial technology professors know what they are going to teach, facilitate, and evaluate to ensure students benefit Incorporating scoring rubrics to industrial technology course assessments from their courses. are one way to evaluate student's responses to performance assessments. Both analytical and holistic scoring rubrics can be used to evaluate industrial technology courses. Once the performance assessments, with accompanying scoring rubrics are designed, the coursework objectives are facilitated, to prepare students for the upcoming assessment administered. Utilizing rubrics increases both instructors' and students' accountability for student learning with the accountability of the program. The industrial technology program is required by the professional accrediting agencies to prepare students for the professional careers. Designing and implementing a systematic industrial technology course evaluation is beneficial to students and industrial technology departments.

2. Scoring Rubrics

Educators design the scoring rubric with a descriptive format that evaluates and determines the students' performance based on required criteria to meet course content goals. Scoring rubrics will define the required effort, quality, and judgment necessary to master course objectives. Foundational skills and content knowledge are required to create a toolpath for the CAD/CAM process [5]. This performance objective can be evaluated using scoring rubrics. The score ranges are based on descriptive scales that reflect the students' mastery level of the set criteria. Rubrics provide two benefits in the evaluation process of a course. First, they support the degree of accomplishments and the extent to which specific criteria has been mastered. Second, they provide feedback to students with suggestions to improve on their performance.

2.1 Different Types of Scoring Rubrics

Several different types of scoring rubrics are available. Two widely used types of rubrics are analytical and holistic. Holistic rubrics are appropriate when there is no one specific answer for the project. Holistic scoring rubrics support broader judgments concerning the quality of the process or product. The ability to use layers to create geometry for each available toolpath is an example of a holistic scoring rubric. Analytical rubrics provide more information than holistic rubrics. Analytical rubrics can be used by industrial technology departments in assessing a student's skill in completing a project. For example, the students are required to understand and achieve mastery to create and edit geometry for the purpose of toolpath creation. Then apply different toolpaths to create a part and correctly use tool parameters. An analytical rubric defines the skill needed for each part of CAD/CAM process. The holistic rubric does not list separate levels of performance for each criterion. Instead it provides a level of mastery across multiple criteria as whole [1,3]

2.2 Developing Scoring Rubrics

The first step in developing a scoring rubric is to identify the technical skills and content knowledge necessary to assess student proficiency on course objectives. Next we evaluate the desired outcome from the assessment and determine to use analytical or holistic scoring rubrics. Both the top level performance and lowest level of performance criteria should be defined by the evaluator. The contrast between the top level performance criterion and bottom level performance criterion will help to write the criterion for middle level performance. The following steps involved to develop scoring rubrics:

- 1. Define and list learning objectives for a technical course.
- 2. Identify the specific attributes that students should demonstrate in their performance.
- 3. Identify each attribute and its characteristics.
- 4. Identify excellent versus poor work using narrative descriptive criteria.
- 5. For holistic rubrics, state the highest and lowest levels of performance combining the descriptors for all attributes.
- 6. For analytical rubrics, state the highest and lowest levels of performance using the descriptions for each attribute separately.
- 7. Collect student work and record the results.
- 8. Update and revise the rubric as necessary.

Holistic Scoring Rubric Generating Toolpath Using CAD/CAM System

4 Points

Toolpath is correct and functional contains a drawing with different layers and needed parameters and verifies perfectly. Consistently does all of the following:

- All available toolpaths including contour, face, pocket, drill and island is used in the geometry.
- Layers are used for each individual toolpath at a time.
- All sections of the geometry are enclosed and if lines are intersecting they have been placed on different layers.
- Tool parameters and toolpath parameters are set correctly.
- Tool used in generating the toolpath model is selected correctly and it results in generating the toolpath model without any overcuts caused by selecting the wrong size cutter.

3 Points

Toolpath is correct and functional contains a drawing with different layers and needed parameters and verifies perfectly. Consistently does all of the following:

- Only contour, face, pocket and drill are used in the geometry. Island function is not used in the toolpath.
- Layers are used for each individual toolpath at a time.
- All sections of the geometry are enclosed and if lines are intersecting they have

been placed on different layers.

- Tool parameters and toolpath parameters are set correctly.
- Tool used in generating the toolpath model is selected correctly and it results in generating the toolpath model without any overcuts caused by selecting the wrong size cutter.

2 Points

Toolpath is correct and functional but geometry does not contain different layers. Does most or many of the following:

- Layers are not used for each individual toolpath at a time.
- All sections of the geometry are enclosed and are drawn on the same layer.
- Geometry is simple and one or two available toolpath is used.
- Selected tool size from the library is incorrect and produces a toolpath model which has overcuts.

1 Point

The toolpath is simple and functional. Consistently does all of the following.

- Geometry is simple and some lines overlap other lines, so toolpath cannot be created for section of the geometry.
- Tool parameters and toolpath parameters are not set correctly.
- Toolpath generates an error message when it is verified.
- The geometry and the toolpath parameter need to be edited before it can be verified.

Figure 1: Holistic Scoring Rubric for CAD/CAM Process

Analytical Scoring Rubric								
Generating Toolpath on a CAD/CAM System								
Criteria	Beginning	Developing	Accomplished	Exemplary	Score			
	1	2	3	4				
Understanding	Only simple	Simple	Geometry is	Geometry is				
how to create	geometry is	geometry	complex the	complex and				
geometry,	used.	with	layer function	multi level,				
editing	Geometry	different	is used to	different layers				
geometry and	contains lines,	sections is	avoid overlap	are used for				
be able to use	arcs and fillet	drawn on	between	each toolpath				
layers in the	geometry is	the same	different parts	function				
geometry.	drawn on a	layer the	of drawing	toolpath verify				
	single layer.	geometry is	geometry is	correctly and				
		correct and	correct and	generates a				
		functional.	functional.	complex part.				
Understanding	The finished	The part is	The part is	The part is a				
of all possible	part is simple	simple all	complex all	complex shape				
toolpaths	tool retraction	toolpaths	toolpaths are	all available				
including	is not used.	have the	created at the	toolpaths are				
contour,	One or two of	same	same level not	combined to				

drill and face assigned to each layer.toolpaths are used.all toolpaths are used but not the island.toolpaths are used.multi level part.Correct use of tools, tool parameters, toolpathOnly toolpath parameterParameters including feed rate, spindleParametersParameters including feed rate, spindleParameters speed, plunge speed, plunge speed, plunge rate and depthParamet and depth rate, retractused, which toolpathrate and depth of cut is setspeed, cut is set by and depth of the operator; directionof cut is set machineof cut is set the operator; directionof cut is set machineapplied to toolpath program is verified.parameters of cutdirection directionMachine the operator; directioncutting method is set machinecutting direction, distance are distance are distance are distance are distance are distance areall toolpath also set toolpathToolpath generationOnly contour toolpathMore than one operatedToolpath is generatedAll available toolpathToolpath skills and part generationOnly contour toolpath is availableMore than toolpathToolpath is toolpathAll available toolpath					
assigned to each layer.used.are used but not the island.used.part.Correct use of tools, tool parametersOnly toolpath parameterParametersParametersParametersincluding feed parameters, toolpathrate, spindlespindlespeed, plungerate, spindlerate, spindle parameters are used, which together are of cut is setspeed, plungespeed, plungerate and depthof cut is set applied to toolpathof cut is set by machinerate and depthrate and depthtoolpath rotegether are toolpathoperator the machinethe operator, the operator;of cut is setapplied to toolpathby the rest of the machinecutting cuttingcutting cuttingcutting direction,model when program is verified.are at default value.cutting step over machinecutting machinecutting distance are parameter is also set used.only rough step overToolpath generation werified.Only contour on drill oneMore than generatedToolpath is still and part toolpath is or drillToolpath is step overAll available toolpath	pocket, island,	available	elevations;	all available	create a 3D
each layer.not the island.not the island.'Correct use of tools, tool parameters, tools, tool parameters, including feedOnly toolpath including feed feed rate, spindleParameters including feed rate, spindleParameters including feed rate, spindleParameters including feed rate, spindleparameters are used, which rate and depth rate and depthspeed, plunge plunge speed, plunge rate and depthspeed, plunge speed, plunge speed, plunge rate and depth plunge rate of cut is set of cut is set and depth of the operator, directionof cut is set machineof cut is set correctly.generate a program is verified.operator the value.the operator; method and step over machinedirection, method is set correctly, and methods and step over machining distance are parameter is also set correctly.Toolpath generationOnly contour or drill toolpath is availableMore than available toolpath is step overToolpath is available toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath isAll available toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath		1	1	1	multi level
Image: Construct of the spin of the sp	assigned to	used.	are used but	used.	part.
Correct use of tools, tool parameters, toolpathOnly toolpath parameter including feed rate, spindleParameters including feed rate, spindleParameters including feed rate, spindletoolpath parameters are used, which together are applied to porgram is verified.including feed feed rate, speed, plunge speed, plunge and depthspeed, plunge speed, plunge of cut is set to of cut is set and depth of the operator, directionParameters including feed rate, spindle speed, plunge of cut is set the operator, directionParameters including feed rate, spindle speed, plunge rate and depth of cut is set the operator, directionParameters including feed rate, spindle of cut is set the operator; directionParameters rate and depth of cut is set by machine cut is set by machine cut is set to operator the model when program is are at default verified.Parameters are at default value.Parameters rate, spindle of cut is set the operator; direction method and step over machining machining distance are also set correctly.Parameters also set correctly.Toolpath generationOnly contour or drill toolpath is available used. OneMore than toolpath is toolpath is <td>each layer.</td> <td></td> <td>not the</td> <td></td> <td></td>	each layer.		not the		
tools, tool parameters, toolpathparameter including feedincluding 	-		island.		
tools, toolparameterincludingincluding feedincluding feedparameters,including feedfeed rate,rate, spindlerate, spindlerate, spindletoolpathrate, spindlespeed, plungespeed, plungespeed, plungerate, retractparameters arespeed, plungespeed,rate and depthrate, retractrate, retractused, whichrate and depthplunge rateof cut is set byrate and depthof cut is setapplied toof cut is setand depth ofthe operator,of cut is setof cut is setgenerate aoperator thethe operator;direction,Machinetoolpathrest of themachinecuttingdirection,model whenparametersdirectionmethod is setcuttingprogram isare at defaultcuttingcorrectly, andmethods andverified.value.method andonly roughstep overdistance arenot setused.correctly.istance arenot setused.correctly.correctly.istance arefoolpathOnly contourMore thanToolpath isAll availablegenerationor drillonegeneratedtoolpath isgenerationused. Onetoolpath istoolpathoptions	Correct use of	Only toolpath	Parameters	Parameters	Parameters
parameters, toolpathincluding feed rate, spindlefeed rate, spindlerate, spindlerate, spindlerate, spindleparameters are used, whichspeed, plungespeed,rate and depthrate and depthrate, retracttogether are applied to toolpathof cut is setand depth of the operator;the operator, directionof cut is setof cut is setapplied to toolpathby the rest of the parameterscut is set by the operator;machine directioncorrectly.generate a toolpathoperator the rest of the value.machinecutting correctly, and method and step overcuttingdirection, method is set parameter isverified.value.method and step over distance are not set not setonly rough step overstep over machiningalso set toolpath isToolpath generationOnly contour or drillMore than one savailableToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath is availablecorrectly.	tools, tool		including	including feed	including feed
toolpath parameters are used, whichrate, spindle speed, plungespindle speed, plunge rate and depthspindle rate and depthspeed, plunge rate and depthspeed, plunge rate, retracttogether are applied to generate a toolpathof cut is set by the rest of the parametersand depth of cut is set by the operator; directionthe operator, machineof cut is set correctly.generate a toolpathoperator the rest of the parametersthe operator; directiondirection, method is set cuttingdirection, method is set cuttingwerified.value.method and step over distance are also set not set correctly.only rough machinestep over also set correctly.Toolpath generationOnly contour or drillMore than one availableToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath is availableToolpath generationUsed. Oneone toolpath is toolpath isAll available toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is	·	-	•	0	e
parameters are used, which together are applied to by thespeed, plunge rate and depthrate and depth of cut is set and depth of the operator,rate and depth of cut is set machinerate and depthapplied to applied to toolpath model when program is verified.by the parameters are at default value.cut is set by the operator; directionmethod is set cut ing cut ing cut ing cut ing correctly, and only rough machinerate, retract rate and depthToolpath generation or drillOnly contour or drillMore than one availableToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath is or drillToolpath skills and part generationOnly contour used. OneMore than toolpath isToolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath isToolpath is toolpath is toolpath is toolpath isAll available toolpath is toolpath is toolpath is	-	U	,	· •	· •
used, which together are applied to generate arate and depth of cut is set by theplunge rate and depth of the operator, the operator;of cut is set by the operator, directionrate and depth of cut is set of cut is setgenerate a toolpathoperator the rest of the parameterscut is set by the operator;machine directioncorrectly.model when program is verified.parameters are at default value.direction method and step over distance are not set correctly.methods and only rough machining parameter is used.step over also set correctly.Toolpath generation skills and part generationOnly contour toolpath is used. OneMore than available toolpath is oneToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath is or drill	1	· 1	1	1 1 0	1 1 2
together are applied to generate aof cut is set setand depth of cut is set by the operator;the operator, machineof cut is set correctly.generate a toolpathoperator the rest of thethe operator; machinedirectionMachinemodel when program is verified.parameters are at defaultdirection cuttingmethod is set cuttingcuttingverified.value.method and step overonly rough machiningstep over distance are also setstep overToolpath generationOnly contour or drillMore than oneToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath is or drillMore than availableToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath is one	-	1 1 0	1 ·	1	
applied to generate aby the operator the rest of thecut is set by the operator; directionmachine directioncorrectly.model when program is verified.parameters are at default value.direction method and step overmethod is set only rough machiningcutting methods and only roughcutting methods and distance are also setToolpath generationOnly contour or drill used. OneMore than oneToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath is options			1 0	•	
Prime generate a toolpathoperator the rest of the parametersthe operator; machinedirection cuttingMachine direction, cuttingmodel when program is verified.parameters are at default value.direction cuttingmethod is set correctly, andcutting methods and step over machiningmethods and only roughverified.value.method and step over distance are distance are also set correctly.only rough machiningstep over distance are also set correctly.Toolpath generationOnly contour or drillMore than availableToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath isKills and part generationtoolpath is used. Oneavailable toolpath isusing different toolpath isoptions including the	U		1	-	
toolpath model when program isrest of the parametersmachine directioncuttingdirection, method is setprogram is verified.are at default value.cuttingcorrectly, andmethods andverified.value.method and step overonly rough machiningstep overdistance are distance are distance aredistance arealso setord rel generationOnly contourMore than oneToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath iskills and part generationtoolpath is used. Oneavailable toolpath isusing different toolpath isoptions including the		•			•
model when program isparameters are at defaultdirection cuttingmethod is set correctly, andcutting methods andverified.value.method and step overonly roughstep over distance aredistance are also setue.step overmachiningdistance are also setalso setue.not setused.correctly.used.correctly.correctly.ToolpathOnly contourMore than oneToolpath isAll availableskills and parttoolpath isavailableusing different toolpath isoptionsused. Onetoolpath istoolpath isincluding the	0				
program is verified.are at default are at default value.cutting method and step overcorrectly, and only rough machiningmethods and step overvalue.method and step overonly rough machiningstep overdistance are distance areparameter is used.also set correctly.Toolpath generationOnly contour or drillMore than availableToolpath is using differentAll available toolpath isskills and part generationtoolpath is used. Oneavailable toolpath isusing different toolpathoptions including the				C	<i>,</i>
verified.value.method and step overonly rough machiningstep over distance are also setused.distance are distance are not setparameter is used.also setToolpath generationOnly contour or drillMore than oneToolpath is generatedAll available toolpath iskills and part generationtoolpath is used. Oneavailable toolpath isusing different toolpathoptions including the		1			e
step over distance are distance are not set correctly.machining parameter is used.distance are also set correctly.Toolpath generationOnly contour or drillMore than oneToolpath is generatedAll available toolpathskills and part generationtoolpath is used. Oneavailable toolpath isusing different toolpathoptions including the	1 0		U	•	
distance are not set correctly.parameter is used.also set correctly.Toolpath generationOnly contour or drillMore than oneToolpath is generatedAll available toolpathskills and part generationtoolpath is used. Oneavailable toolpath is toolpath isusing different toolpathoptions including the	vermed.	value.			±
Image: Not set correctly.Image: Not set used.Correctly.ToolpathOnly contourMore thanToolpath isAll availablegenerationor drillonegeneratedtoolpathskills and parttoolpath isavailableusing differentoptionsgenerationused. Onetoolpath istoolpathincluding the			1	Ŭ	
correctly.correctly.ToolpathOnly contourMore thanToolpath isAll availablegenerationor drillonegeneratedtoolpathskills and parttoolpath isavailableusing differentoptionsgenerationused. Onetoolpath istoolpathincluding the				-	
Toolpath generationOnly contour or drillMore than oneToolpath is generatedAll available toolpathskills and part generationtoolpath is used. Oneavailable toolpath isusing different toolpathoptions including the				usea.	correctly.
generationor drillonegeneratedtoolpathskills and parttoolpath isavailableusing differentoptionsgenerationused. Onetoolpath istoolpathincluding the		<u> </u>			
skills and parttoolpath is used. Oneavailable toolpath isusing different toolpathoptions including the	1	•		-	
generation used. One toolpath is toolpath including the	U			0	
				Ū.	
complexity is single cutter used a drill options using island are used	U		-	1	e e
	complexity is	single cutter	used, a drill	options using	island are used
evident. is used for the and an end different to create a	evident.			different	
whole mill is used cutters at complex part			mill is used		
operation to generate a different using multi		operation to	to generate a		
create a part. elevation to cutters with		create a	part.	elevation to	cutters with
simple part. generate a different depth		simple part.		generate a	different depth
functional of cut.				functional	of cut.
part.				part.	

Figure 2: Analytical Scoring Rubric for CAD/CAM Process

3. Conclusion

An informative assessment is the process of measuring educational effectiveness with comparisons to a set of standards, goals and objectives. Scoring rubrics use a descriptive scoring format that develops a common thread for evaluation process of industrial technology courses. Rubrics are a motivating tool for students, feeding them the necessary confidence to meet required expectations outlined within the mastery levels. The feedback encourages students to inquire why they received the score they earned and improve their overall performance.

References

- [1] Airasian, P. W. (2001). Classroom Assessment: Concepts and Applications (4th ed.) Boston: McGraw-Hill
- [2] Mertler, C. A. (2003). Designing Scoring Rubrics for Your Classroom. <u>Practical Assessment, Research, & Evaluation</u>, 7 (25). Available online: <u>http://pareonline.net/getun.asp?v=7&n=3</u>.
- [3] Chase, C. I. (1999) Contemporary Assessment for Educators New York: Longman.
- [4] Moskal, B. M. (2000). Scoring Rubrics: What, When, and How? <u>Practical Assessment, Research, & Evaluation</u>, 7(3). Available online: <u>http://pareonline.net/getun.asp?v=7&n=3</u>
- [5] Lin, Johnathon, 2006. MastercamX Mill and Solids. Ann Arbor, MI: Scholar International Publishing Corp.

FARZIN HEIDARI

Dr. Heidari currently serves as an Associate Professor of Industrial Technology at Texas A&M University-Kingsville. Dr. Heidari has twenty years of teaching experience in CAD/CAM courses. He has numerous publications related to innovative ways of teaching CAD/CAM. He is currently serving as the Graduate Coordinator for the Industrial Management Program.